

# Reading Group

## Topic I: Designing Group Decision Making Processes

Ronny Razin

London School of Economics

December 2010

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Finding mechanisms for the *decentralized* moderation of online deliberation and decision making among large groups of people.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Finding mechanisms for the *decentralized* moderation of online deliberation and decision making among large groups of people.
  - Chats, Forums, moderators...

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Finding mechanisms for the *decentralized* moderation of online deliberation and decision making among large groups of people.
  - Chats, Forums, moderators...
- Why is the internet an interesting application.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Finding mechanisms for the *decentralized* moderation of online deliberation and decision making among large groups of people.
  - Chats, Forums, moderators...
- Why is the internet an interesting application.
  - Physical constraints imply that decision making in large groups has to be concentrated in the hands of the few;

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Finding mechanisms for the *decentralized* moderation of online deliberation and decision making among large groups of people.
  - Chats, Forums, moderators...
- Why is the internet an interesting application.
  - Physical constraints imply that decision making in large groups has to be concentrated in the hands of the few;
  - **The internet allows for fast information flows between decision makers and for better and quicker decisions.**

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet





































- Finding mechanisms for the *decentralized* moderation of online deliberation and decision making among large groups of people.
  - Chats, Forums, moderators...
- Why is the internet an interesting application.
  - Physical constraints imply that decision making in large groups has to be concentrated in the hands of the few;
  - The internet allows for fast information flows between decision makers and for better and quicker decisions.
  - May allow for the implementation of sophisticated mechanisms of deliberation and decision making that are not feasible in day-to-day decision making processes.

180 Discussions

Month

Board Categories

PAGE: 1 2 3 4

Replies		Topics	Last Post
4 Replies		<b>Snow Watch UK</b> (5 NEW!) Posted 6 Hours, 21 Minutes ago by <a href="#">yorkfox</a> Category: <b>Off Topic</b> Views: 34	 Last Post by <a href="#">upduck</a> 1 Minute ago
7 Replies		<b>Ten Personal Questions</b> (8 NEW!) Posted 2 Days, 19 Hours ago by <a href="#">Pete Langton</a> Category: <b>Football</b> Views: 85	 Last Post by <a href="#">Mark_Curtis</a> 1 Hour, 13 Minutes ago
5 Replies		<b>Next Weds Lotto?</b> (6 NEW!) Posted 1 Day ago by <a href="#">weenie</a> Category: <b>Lotto Syndicate</b> Views: 21	 Last Post by <a href="#">weenie</a> 1 Hour, 47 Minutes ago
57 Replies		<b>cost of MyFC membership fee</b> (58 NEW!) [Page: 1,2,3] Posted 1 Week, 5 Days ago by <a href="#">very tenables</a> Category: <b>Society</b> Views: 455	 Last Post by <a href="#">MadHatter</a> 1 Hour, 57 Minutes ago
267 Replies		<b>Daily tips competition thread</b> ★ (268 NEW!) [Page: 1...9,10,11] Posted 2 Months, 1 Week ago by <a href="#">kenny8</a> Category: <b>The Horse Racing Group</b> Views: 742	 Last Post by <a href="#">caswat3a</a> 2 Hours, 8 Minutes ago
50 Replies		<b>Discount Game - Winter Warmer!</b> (51 NEW!) [Page: 1,2,3] Posted 3 Weeks ago by <a href="#">MadHatter</a> Category: <b>Society</b> Views: 298	 Last Post by <a href="#">MadHatter</a> 2 Hours, 36 Minutes ago
5 Replies		<b>Winter</b> (6 NEW!) Posted 18 Hours, 23 Minutes ago by <a href="#">club_secretary</a> Category: <b>Football</b> Views: 61	 Last Post by <a href="#">Graeme23</a> 3 Hours, 9 Minutes ago
380 Replies		<b>Word Association</b> ★ (381 NEW!) [Page: 1...14,15,16] Posted 2 Months, 2 Weeks ago by <a href="#">theredtoothbrush_beta</a> Category: <b>Off Topic</b> Views: 1314	 Last Post by <a href="#">neil.udall</a> 7 Hours, 58 Minutes ago
11 Replies		<b>Newsletter Feedback.</b> (12 NEW!) Posted 2 Days, 22 Hours ago by <a href="#">yorkfox</a> Category: <b>Unofficial Email Newsletter Group Forum</b> Views: 105	 Last Post by <a href="#">jzucal</a> 14 Hours, 44 Minutes ago
160 Replies		<b>Welcome to new member</b> (161 NEW!) [Page: 1...5,6,7] Posted 2 Months, 1 Week ago by <a href="#">TheRedToothbrush</a> Category: <b>Welcome to MyFC</b> Views: 909	 Last Post by <a href="#">roca</a> 17 Hours, 35 Minutes ago
1 Replies		<b>test</b> (2 NEW!) Posted 1 Day, 2 Hours ago by <a href="#">jon</a> Category: <b>Jon's Test Group</b> Views: 13	 Last Post by <a href="#">roca</a> 17 Hours, 39 Minutes ago
103 Replies		<b>Daily tips comp results tables</b> (104 NEW!) [Page: 1...3,4,5] Posted 2 Months, 1 Week ago by <a href="#">caswat3a</a> Category: <b>The Horse Racing Group</b> Views: 402	 Last Post by <a href="#">kenny8</a> 19 Hours, 8 Minutes ago
4 Replies		<b>SMS Match Updates</b> (5 NEW!) Posted 5 Days, 2 Hours ago by <a href="#">thirkettle31</a> Category: <b>Football</b> Views: 62	 Last Post by <a href="#">club_secretary</a> 22 Hours, 37 Minutes ago
7 Replies		<b>Attending Dec 4th game?</b> (8 NEW!) Posted 1 Week, 6 Days ago by <a href="#">alexgloc</a> Category: <b>MyFC United States</b> Views: 60	 Last Post by <a href="#">Barda</a> 22 Hours, 49 Minutes ago
65 Replies		<b>King or Queen Napster Competition</b> (66 NEW!) [Page: 1,2,3] Posted 2 Months, 2 Weeks ago by <a href="#">upduck_beta</a> Category: <b>The Horse Racing Group</b> Views: 61	 Last Post by <a href="#">upduck</a> 23 Hours, 18 Minutes ago
0 Replies		<b>Tagging Members in posts!</b> (1 NEW!) Posted 1 Day, 2 Hours ago by <a href="#">MadHatter</a> Category: <b>Website</b> Views: 13	 Last Post by <a href="#">MadHatter</a> 1 Day, 2 Hours ago
82 Replies		<b>Can We Count To 10,000?</b> (83 NEW!) [Page: 1...2,3,4] Posted 4 Weeks, 1 Day ago by <a href="#">Howezy</a> Category: <b>Off Topic</b> Views: 341	 Last Post by <a href="#">caswat3a</a> 1 Day, 2 Hours ago
22 Replies		<b>How do I stop the emails?</b> (23 NEW!) Posted 2 Months, 2 Weeks ago by <a href="#">Harry J Allstars</a> Category: <b>Website</b> Views: 166	 Last Post by <a href="#">jon</a> 1 Day, 2 Hours ago



## Proposals

Here are the latest proposals that have been published to the Society. Use the top menu to filter proposals that have passed or failed.



### MyFC Membership Re-structuring

Published on Saturday, 30 October 2010 | Submitted by Very Tenables | Hits: 234

Proposal re two tiered memberships, and membership fees.

Deadline: Sat 6 Nov 2010 15:31    7 comments    Passed



### Provide funding for Cameraman

Published on Friday, 08 October 2010 | Submitted by Robert Tveter | Hits: 231

Ability to provide highlights

Deadline: Fri 15 Oct 2010 12:00    1 comment    Passed



### Bringing decision making at the club to members & re-engaging with the club.

Published on Wednesday, 06 October 2010 | Submitted by Arithon | Hits: 371

Deadline: Wed 13 Oct 2010 21:32    11 comments    Passed



### Proposal - Reinstatement of Lapsed Members

Published on Thursday, 16 September 2010 | Submitted by Arithon | Hits: 348

Deadline: Fri 24 Sep 2010 20:15    11 comments    Passed



### Proposal - "Promotional" Membership Offers

Published on Tuesday, 14 September 2010 | Submitted by Alterego | Hits: 211

Deadline: Fri 24 Sep 2010 20:16    4 comments    Failed



### This is a test proposal

Published on Friday, 10 September 2010 | Submitted by julio | Hits: 156

This is just a test proposal. Please second it as a final test.

Deadline: Sat 18 Sep 2010 12:40    1 comment    Failed

#### Society

Votes  
Proposals  
Submit a vote proposal  
Finance

#### Content

Articles & Blogs  
Proposals  
Votes  
Match Reports

#### Community

MyFC Community  
My Profile  
Forums

#### Groups

Join a group  
My Groups  
Create a group

# Vote: FA Trophy Match Price v Hayes & Yeading FAT1

Published on Wednesday, 24 November 2010 | Page views: 274

Match price for FA Trophy match v Hayes & Yeading

After The Fleets 4-0 F.A Trophy win against Bromley on Tuesday, it's now time to set the admission price for the 1st round proper at home to Hayes and Yeading United on Saturday December 11th 2010.

Peter Danzey, the EUFC Club Secretary says "The club feel that lower prices would be a thank you for supporters and with Christmas on the horizon, hence the reason this time we feel that £12 & £6 should not be an option this time. I need the vote to finish at 10-00am on Friday 26th November in order that I can complete the Match Arrangement Form and fax it to the FA.

For information, should a replay be necessary Hayes & Yeading will be charging £14 & £8 and are not prepared to budge on these prices."

In the F.A Trophy, gate receipts are shared between the 2 clubs. Our normal Blue Square Bet South league prices are £11 Adult and £5 Concession. Hayes and Yeading play in the Blue Square Conference which is one league above us.

Last modified on: Wednesday, 24 November 2010 20:20



**RATE THIS VOTE**

0.0/5 rating (0 votes)

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Some things to think about

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Some things to think about
  - Information aggregation: The need to collect the available information from participants to allow for better decision making.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Some things to think about
  - Information aggregation: The need to collect the available information from participants to allow for better decision making.
  - Congestion: Deliberations are often conducted in the presence of time constraints which imply a need to ration and select a relatively small number of people who can speak and share their information.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Some things to think about
  - Information aggregation: The need to collect the available information from participants to allow for better decision making.
  - Congestion: Deliberations are often conducted in the presence of time constraints which imply a need to ration and select a relatively small number of people who can speak and share their information.
    - Auctions?

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Some things to think about
  - Information aggregation: The need to collect the available information from participants to allow for better decision making.
  - Congestion: Deliberations are often conducted in the presence of time constraints which imply a need to ration and select a relatively small number of people who can speak and share their information.
    - Auctions?
  - Attention constraints: People are often limited in their ability to listen, digest and filter simultaneous pieces of information.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Motivation: Designing discussion groups on the internet

- Some things to think about
  - Information aggregation: The need to collect the available information from participants to allow for better decision making.
  - Congestion: Deliberations are often conducted in the presence of time constraints which imply a need to ration and select a relatively small number of people who can speak and share their information.
    - Auctions?
  - Attention constraints: People are often limited in their ability to listen, digest and filter simultaneous pieces of information.
  - **Negative externalities.**



# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- The importance of sequentiality in debates.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- The importance of sequentiality in debates.
  - Usually simultaneous mechanism deliver all the possible outcomes: Gerardi and Yariv (2007).

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- The importance of sequentiality in debates.
  - Usually simultaneous mechanism deliver all the possible outcomes: Gerardi and Yariv (2007).
  - **Exceptions: Glazer and Rubinstein, Balasz and Gershkov, Levy and Razin.**

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- The importance of sequentiality in debates.
  - Usually simultaneous mechanism deliver all the possible outcomes: Gerardi and Yariv (2007).
  - Exceptions: Glazer and Rubinstein, Balasz and Gershkov, Levy and Razin.
- Mechanism design of debates or group decision making

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- The importance of sequentiality in debates.
  - Usually simultaneous mechanism deliver all the possible outcomes: Gerardi and Yariv (2007).
  - Exceptions: Glazer and Rubinstein, Balasz and Gershkov, Levy and Razin.
- Mechanism design of debates or group decision making
  - Most of the literature is Positive...

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- The importance of sequentiality in debates.
  - Usually simultaneous mechanism deliver all the possible outcomes: Gerardi and Yariv (2007).
  - Exceptions: Glazer and Rubinstein, Balasz and Gershkov, Levy and Razin.
- Mechanism design of debates or group decision making
  - Most of the literature is Positive...
  - ... with Negative externalities (Auctions: Jehiel, Moldevanu and Stachetti...)

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- The importance of sequentiality in debates.
  - Usually simultaneous mechanism deliver all the possible outcomes: Gerardi and Yariv (2007).
  - Exceptions: Glazer and Rubinstein, Balasz and Gershkov, Levy and Razin.
- Mechanism design of debates or group decision making
  - Most of the literature is Positive...
  - ... with Negative externalities (Auctions: Jehiel, Moldevanu and Stachetti...)
  - Glazer and Rubinstein, Jackson and Sonnenshine Hortalá-Vallve...

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?



# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?
  - Allot of the literature focuses on what's good...

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?
  - Allot of the literature focuses on what's good...
    - Arrows theorem...

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?
  - Allot of the literature focuses on what's good...
    - Arrows theorem...
  - Congestion, time constraints, attention constraints...

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?
  - Allot of the literature focuses on what's good...
    - Arrows theorem...
  - Congestion, time constraints, attention constraints...
- **Linking decisions.**

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?
  - Allot of the literature focuses on what's good...
    - Arrows theorem...
  - Congestion, time constraints, attention constraints...
- Linking decisions.
- Are auctions a useful tool to think about?

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?
  - Allot of the literature focuses on what's good...
    - Arrows theorem...
  - Congestion, time constraints, attention constraints...
- Linking decisions.
- Are auctions a useful tool to think about?
  - Auctioning off speaking rights

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Some themes in (or missing in) the literature

- What's bad about having decisions taken in large groups?
  - Allot of the literature focuses on what's good...
    - Arrows theorem...
  - Congestion, time constraints, attention constraints...
- Linking decisions.
- Are auctions a useful tool to think about?
  - Auctioning off speaking rights
  - Auctioning off voting rights

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Papers

- 1 Auctions with negative externalities:



# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### 1 Auctions with negative externalities:

- 1 Jehiel Moldovanu and Stachetti, "How (Not) to Sell Nuclear Weapons". (and some others by the same authors).

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### ① Auctions with negative externalities:

- ① Jehiel Moldovanu and Stachetti, "How (Not) to Sell Nuclear Weapons". (and some others by the same authors).

### ② Linking Decisions:

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### 1 Auctions with negative externalities:

- 1 Jehiel Moldovanu and Stachetti, "How (Not) to Sell Nuclear Weapons". (and some others by the same authors).

### 2 Linking Decisions:

- 1 Jackson & Sonnenschein, Overcoming Incentive Constraints by Linking Decisions, *Econometrica*, 75 (2007), 241–257.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### ① Auctions with negative externalities:

- ① Jehiel Moldovanu and Stachetti, "How (Not) to Sell Nuclear Weapons". (and some others by the same authors).

### ② Linking Decisions:

- ① Jackson & Sonnenschein, Overcoming Incentive Constraints by Linking Decisions, *Econometrica*, 75 (2007), 241–257.
- ② Casella, *Storable Votes and Agenda Order Control. Theory and Experiments*, <http://www.columbia.edu/c186/>, Mimeo Columbia.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### 1 Auctions with negative externalities:

- 1 Jehiel Moldovanu and Stachetti, "How (Not) to Sell Nuclear Weapons". (and some others by the same authors).

### 2 Linking Decisions:

- 1 Jackson & Sonnenschein, Overcoming Incentive Constraints by Linking Decisions, *Econometrica*, 75 (2007), 241–257.
- 2 Casella, Storable Votes and Agenda Order Control. Theory and Experiments, <http://www.columbia.edu/c186/>, Mimeo Columbia.
- 3 Hortalá-Vallve, R., Inefficiencies on Linking Decisions, *Social Choice and Welfare*, Volume 34, Number 3, 2010

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Papers

## 3. Mechanism design and debates

## 3. Mechanism design and debates

- ① Rubinstein and Glazer, On Optimal Rules of Persuasion, with J. Glazer, *Econometrica*, 72 (2004), 1715-1736.

### 3. Mechanism design and debates

- ① Rubinstein and Glazer, On Optimal Rules of Persuasion, with J. Glazer, *Econometrica*, 72 (2004), 1715-1736.
- ② Rubinstein and Glazer, A Study in the Pragmatics of Persuasion: A Game Theoretical Approach, *Theoretical Economics*, 1 (2006).



# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### 3. Mechanism design and debates

- 1 Rubinstein and Glazer, On Optimal Rules of Persuasion, with J. Glazer, *Econometrica*, 72 (2004), 1715-1736.
- 2 Rubinstein and Glazer, A Study in the Pragmatics of Persuasion: A Game Theoretical Approach, *Theoretical Economics*, 1 (2006).
- 3 Rubinstein and Glazer, Debates and Decisions, On a Rationale of Argumentation Rules, *Games and Economic Behavior*, 36 (2001), 158-173.

## 3. Mechanism design and debates

- 1 Rubinstein and Glazer, On Optimal Rules of Persuasion, with J. Glazer, *Econometrica*, 72 (2004), 1715-1736.
- 2 Rubinstein and Glazer, A Study in the Pragmatics of Persuasion: A Game Theoretical Approach, *Theoretical Economics*, 1 (2006).
- 3 Rubinstein and Glazer, Debates and Decisions, On a Rationale of Argumentation Rules, *Games and Economic Behavior*, 36 (2001), 158-173.
- 4 Balasz and Gershkov, "Optimal Voting Scheme with Costly Information Acquisition," , *Journal of Economic Theory*, <http://home.uchicago.edu/~szentes/votingp.pdf>.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

Papers

## 4. The importance of sequentiality.

## 4. The importance of sequentiality.

- ① Balasz and Gershkov, "Optimal Voting Scheme with Costly Information Acquisition," , *Journal of Economic Theory*, <http://home.uchicago.edu/~szentes/votingp.pdf>.

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### 4. The importance of sequentiality.

- 1 Balasz and Gershkov, "Optimal Voting Scheme with Costly Information Acquisition," , *Journal of Economic Theory*,  
<http://home.uchicago.edu/~szentes/votingp.pdf>.
- 2 Gerardi and Yariv, *Deliberative voting*, *Journal of Economic Theory*,  
[http://www.lrz.de/~u516262/webserver/webdata/yariv\\_gerardi2007\\_jet.pdf](http://www.lrz.de/~u516262/webserver/webdata/yariv_gerardi2007_jet.pdf)

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### 4. The importance of sequentiality.

- 1 Balasz and Gershkov, "Optimal Voting Scheme with Costly Information Acquisition," , *Journal of Economic Theory*, <http://home.uchicago.edu/~szentes/votingp.pdf>.
- 2 Gerardi and Yariv, Deliberative voting, *Journal of Economic Theory*, [http://www.lrz.de/~u516262/webserver/webdata/yariv\\_gerardi2007\\_jet.pdf](http://www.lrz.de/~u516262/webserver/webdata/yariv_gerardi2007_jet.pdf).
- 3 Levy & Razin, <http://personal.lse.ac.uk/levyg1/simple.pdf>, Mimeo LSE. A simple paper to introduce the question: "Should we auction off the right to speak/vote?".

# Topic I: "Designing Group Decision Making Processes"

## Papers

### 4. The importance of sequentiality.

- 1 Balasz and Gershkov, "Optimal Voting Scheme with Costly Information Acquisition," , *Journal of Economic Theory*, <http://home.uchicago.edu/~szentes/votingp.pdf>.
- 2 Gerardi and Yariv, Deliberative voting, *Journal of Economic Theory*, [http://www.lrz.de/~u516262/webserver/webdata/yariv\\_gerardi2007\\_jet.pdf](http://www.lrz.de/~u516262/webserver/webdata/yariv_gerardi2007_jet.pdf).
- 3 Levy & Razin, <http://personal.lse.ac.uk/levyg1/simple.pdf>, Mimeo LSE. A simple paper to introduce the question: "Should we auction off the right to speak/vote?".
- 4 Rubinstein and Glazer, Debates and Decisions, On a Rationale of Argumentation Rules, *Games and Economic Behavior*, 36 (2001), 158-173.